

15 Years:  
Crossroads  
and Horizons



WASHINGTON DC

MOSCOW

BEIJING

BEIRUT

BRUSSELS



Carnegie  
Moscow Center

15 Years:  
Crossroads  
and Horizons

## Carnegie Endowment Global Offices

### Carnegie Moscow Center

16/2 Tverskaya, Moscow

125009, Russia

Tel.: +7 495 935 8904

Fax: +7 495 935 8906

Email: [info@carnegie.ru](mailto:info@carnegie.ru)

[www.carnegie.ru](http://www.carnegie.ru)

### Carnegie Endowment for International Peace

1779 Massachusetts Avenue, NW

Washington, DC, 20036, USA

Tel.: +1 202 483 7600

Fax: +1 202 483 1840

Email: [info@CarnegieEndowment.org](mailto:info@CarnegieEndowment.org)

[www.CarnegieEndowment.org](http://www.CarnegieEndowment.org)

### Beijing Office

China Reform Forum

Room 513, Chang Xin Building

39 Anding Road, Chaoyang District

Beijing, 100029, China

Tel.: +86 10 6443 6667, ext. 627

Fax: +86 10 6894 6780

### Carnegie Middle East Center

Lazarieh Building, Riad el Solh

PO Box 11-1061

Downtown Beirut, Lebanon

Tel.: +961 1 99 1491

Fax: +961 1 99 1591

Email: [info@carnegie-mec.org](mailto:info@carnegie-mec.org)

[www.carnegie-mec.org](http://www.carnegie-mec.org)

### Carnegie Brussels Office

Avenue d'Auderghem, 82

1040 Brussels, Belgium

Tel: +32 2 735 5650

Fax: +32 497 704 961

Email: [info@CarnegieEurope.eu](mailto:info@CarnegieEurope.eu)

[www.CarnegieEurope.eu](http://www.CarnegieEurope.eu)

“RELATIONS BETWEEN RUSSIA AND THE WEST ARE AT THE CENTER OF CARNEGIE’S ATTENTION. FIFTEEN YEARS AGO, WE RESPONDED TO THE GREAT TRANSFORMATION TAKING PLACE IN RUSSIA BY OPENING THE CARNEGIE MOSCOW CENTER. SINCE THEN THE CENTER HAS BECOME ONE OF THE REGION’S LEADING INSTITUTIONS ON THE ISSUES CENTRAL TO RUSSIA’S DOMESTIC EVOLUTION AND INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS SPANNING POLITICAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, ENERGY AND SECURITY CONCERNS. THE WORK HAS BEEN MORE INFORMED THAN MOST BECAUSE IT INVOLVES VIEWS AND EFFORTS FROM RUSSIA, THE U.S. AND EUROPE. FOR THE LAST SEVERAL YEARS THAT WORK HAS BEEN FURTHER ENRICHED BY THE LAUNCH OF CARNEGIE’S *NEW VISION*, ADDING OFFICES IN CHINA, THE MIDDLE EAST AND EUROPE. MOST RECENTLY, THE EURO-ATLANTIC SECURITY INITIATIVE, A HIGH LEVEL COMMISSION INVOLVING RUSSIANS, AMERICANS AND EUROPEANS, EMBODIES THE SPIRIT AND GOALS OF THE *NEW VISION*.”

JESSICA T. MATHEWS

PRESIDENT OF THE CARNEGIE ENDOWMENT FOR INTERNATIONAL PEACE

“...PROMOTE THE SPREAD OF  
UNDERSTANDING AND KNOWLEDGE  
AMONG THE PEOPLE OF THE UNITED  
STATES; ADVANCE THE CAUSE  
OF PEACE BETWEEN NATIONS;  
HASTEN THE TIME WHEN  
PEOPLE WILL RENOUNCE WAR  
AS AN INSTRUMENT OF NATIONAL  
POLICY; ENCOURAGE AND PROMOTE  
PEACEFUL SETTLEMENT OF  
INTERNATIONAL DISPUTES AND  
THE SPREAD OF INTERNATIONAL  
UNDERSTANDING AND CONCORD;  
HELP THE DEVELOPMENT  
OF INTERNATIONAL LAW  
AND THE ADOPTION BY ALL  
COUNTRIES OF ITS FOUNDING  
PRINCIPLES.”

FROM THE CARNEGIE ENDOWMENT'S  
CHARTER, 1910

## An ongoing history



The Carnegie Endowment for International Peace decided to open the Carnegie Moscow Center in 1992. In 1993, Russia's first president, Boris Yeltsin, signed a decree allowing the foundation of the Center, and the Carnegie Moscow Center began work in 1994.

The aim of the Endowment, founded by Andrew Carnegie in 1910, is to "...advance the cause of peace between nations; hasten the time when people will renounce war as an instrument of national policy; encourage and promote peaceful settlement of international disputes and the spread of international understanding and concord; help the development of international law and the adoption by all countries of its founding principles." The Carnegie Moscow Center seeks to achieve this aim by studying the most important issues for Russia and its relations with the international community,

creating forums for free debate on domestic and foreign policy and facilitating the Russian-American dialogue.

During its first years, the Carnegie Moscow Center was involved primarily in organizing seminars and meetings. “Our office was friendly and welcoming,” recalls secretary Natasha Lastochkina, who now, as then, is the first to greet guests at the reception. “It combined Russian warmth with a Western work style: unconditional politeness towards each other, punctuality and reliability.” The Center had only a small team back then. “We worked unbelievably hard,” recalls the Center’s veteran office manager, Alexey Kotov. “There were seminars from morning till evening.” We rented two small rooms in the former Komsomol building on Bolshoi Zlatoustinsky (formerly Bolshoi Komsomolsky) Alley. The Center then moved to Sadovaya-Samotechnaya Street in the Mosenka Plaza building and, in 1997, to its current premises on the corner of Tverskaya Street and the Boulevard Ring.

“SOME DAY IN THE FUTURE, RESEARCHERS EXPLORING THE STATE OF PUBLIC AWARENESS IN RUSSIA IN THE FIRST DECADE OF THE TWENTY-FIRST CENTURY WILL COME ACROSS AN EXCEPTIONAL AND OUT OF THE ORDINARY PHENOMENON, NAMELY, THE INTELLECTUAL, SCIENTIFIC AND CIVIC ROLE PLAYED BY NOT ENTIRELY INSTITUTIONALIZED DISCUSSION AND CREATIVE POLITICAL ANALYSIS CENTERS. OF COURSE, THERE ARE MORE SUCH CENTERS IN MOSCOW THAN IN OTHER RUSSIAN CITIES, EVEN ST. PETERSBURG. BUT THESE FORUMS, THESE ‘INFORMAL COLLEGES’, WHERE PEOPLE GATHER TO REFLECT SERIOUSLY ON THE FUTURE AND PROSPECTS FOR RUSSIA AND THE WORLD, ARE ALL VERY DIFFERENT. THE CARNEGIE MOSCOW CENTER IS ONE OF THE WORTHIER. DISCUSSION HERE IS GENERALLY CONDUCTED ON A VERY HIGH INTELLECTUAL LEVEL. THIS IS REASON TO EXPRESS GREAT RESPECT AND GRATITUDE TO THE PEOPLE WHO ORGANIZE THIS WORK.”

VIKTOR SHEYNIS  
PRINCIPAL ASSOCIATE, INSTITUTE OF WORLD  
ECONOMY AND INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS  
MEMBER OF THE FIRST CONGRESS OF PEOPLE’S  
DEPUTIES OF RUSSIA  
DEPUTY IN THE FIRST AND SECOND RUSSIAN STATE  
DUMAS

The idea of a research center absolutely independent from the state, and with an international staff, was something very new for Russia at that time. “In the 1990s, the Carnegie Moscow Center was unique,” notes Alexey Malashenko, a member of the Center’s Research Council. “There was nothing like it. We provided a forum for discussions and debates. It was a romantic time, a time of genuinely broad-based dialogue to which the Center was better suited than other institutions.” Guests included Mikhail Gorbachev, Yegor Gaidar, Anatoly Chubais, Galina Starovoytova, Gennady Seleznev, Gennady Zyuganov and Vladimir Zhyrinovsky. Parliamentary deputies, ministers and presidents of the CIS countries all came to speak.

“People from different political parties, including very senior officials, accepted our invitations,” says Andrei Ryabov, a member of the Center’s Research Council. “The seminars in which they took part were lively and the discussion was always open and frank. To use the old Soviet cliché, the seminars always left ‘a feeling of deep satisfaction’ because we could see in practice the real contribution we were making to creating a tolerant political culture.”

Leading Russian and foreign scholars were hired to head the Center and its programs, assisted by program coordinators. One of the Center’s objectives was to serve as an example for other research organizations in Russia. Of course, it was an ambitious goal to demonstrate an example of independent research, honest, objective and comprehensive analysis and open dialogue. The Center’s experience was used in establishing other independent Russian centers. It helped Tatyana Maleva, formerly a senior expert at the Carnegie Moscow Center, to set up the Independent Institute of Social Policy, which she has directed since its founding.

“The Carnegie Moscow Center is one of the best places I’ve ever worked,” says Alexei Arbatov. “It’s hard to compete with the Center in terms of organizing research work, the administrative and financial conditions, the creative atmosphere and the relations between staff members. Study, research and intellectual exchange all flourish here, and at the same time, scholars have what they need most of all: complete freedom and time to think, write and read, and all of the support departments and assistants are focused on giving us the best possible conditions for this work. At the same time, we see the young people here growing, turning from assistants into specialists in their own right. I think the Center is a model that all research organizations in Russia today could use, including the Academy of Sciences.”



Gradually the Center began to broaden its work, setting up events not only in Moscow, but also in other Russian cities and regions, and then in neighboring countries. Major conferences on development issues were held in Georgia and Turkmenistan. Conferences on refugees and the role of civil society and religion in multi-ethnic and multi-faith societies took place in Kazan, Ufa, Vladikavkaz, and Bishkek (Kyrgyzstan). Recent years have seen conferences and seminars in Sweden, Uzbekistan, Tajikistan and Kazakhstan, as well as in many Russian cities including St. Petersburg, Astrakhan, Orenburg, Arkhangelsk, Nalchik and Irkutsk.

The Center entered a new phase in its development with the arrival of Rose Gottemoeller as director in January 2006. Before taking this new job, she was deputy secretary of energy in the Clinton administration. Along with her administrative duties as the Center's director, she was also co-chair of its Nonproliferation program. She organized a forum on energy security and a discussion forum on the Iranian nuclear issue. Her time in Moscow coincided, however, with a difficult period in the Center's work. A native of California, Rose arrived in Moscow in the middle of a particularly bleak winter. Soon after, a restrictive new bill on non-governmental organizations was drafted. Her main achievement was not simply preserving the Center, but helping it to consolidate its position as a professional and independent organization.



Rose Gottemoeller was instrumental in arranging visits to Moscow by influential international politicians, public figures and prominent members of the scientific community. Her work helped make the Center practically the only organization in Moscow representing the full spectrum of views.

“Of course, it’s better to hear outside opinions on our work,” comments Lilia Shevtsova, a member of the Center’s Research Council. “We take a sober view of ourselves and we know where we have succeeded and where we have not quite managed. I think that one of our achievements is that we understand how to stay consistent in our positions and in our commitment to diversity of opinions in our own environment, no matter what the political situation. We have created an atmosphere of discussion and dialogue, which, regrettably, has failed to take hold in the society in which we continue to work. But we hope that the ideas and principles we defend will sooner or later become the defining features of the Russian political and intellectual discourse.”

Former scholars of the Carnegie Moscow Center have gone on to hold senior positions in Russian and international state organizations, academic institutions and commercial companies. Our co-workers over the years have included president of



the Center for Strategic Developments Mikhail Dmitriev, former deputy minister of economic development and trade; Yevgeny Gavrilentov, chief economist at a major Russian investment company Troika Dialog and head of the Department of Applied Macroeconomics at the Higher School of Economics; Dmitri Vasiliev, executive director of the Russian Institute of Corporate Law and Management, deputy president of the Russian energy

giant RAO UES, and former chairman of the Russian Federal Securities Commission; Ksenia Yudaeva, chief economist at Sberbank, Russia's largest bank; Vasily Mikheev, corresponding member of the Russian Academy of Sciences; Galina Vitkovskaya, member of the Russian Federal Migration Service's Public Council; and Irina Kobrinskaya, a senior researcher at the Russian Academy of Sciences' Institute of World Economy and International Relations. Alexei Titkov, Peter Topychkanov, Alexei Sidorenko and Sergei Barinov came to us as young researchers and have now become mature professionals, teaching, regularly getting published and frequently commenting on events in the media. Several of our senior staff members have been invited to take up important posts in the Obama administration: Rose Gottemoeller is representing the United States at strategic arms reduction talks as assistant secretary of state, and Michael McFaul, who worked with us in Moscow in 1995–96, has been appointed special assistant to the president on the National Security Council.

Former interns at the Center are now doing well in their work all around the world. Jeffrey Mankoff joined the American Council on Foreign Relations and wrote a book entitled *Russian Foreign Policy: the Return of Great Power Politics*. Alexander Annayev from Turkmenistan works as a consultant at the Risks Department at Deloitte in Moscow. Inga Saikkonen from Finland left to defend her doctoral thesis at Oxford with the aim of then entering the civil service in her own country. Jennifer Arcila, from a Colombian family living in New York, joined the international telecommunications company GSM Systems, where she is in charge of developing new projects in Eastern Europe and Russia. David Zohrabyan began graduate studies at Moscow State University's Department of International Politics and founded the Stanford U.S.-Russia Forum.

We see our 15<sup>th</sup> anniversary not just as a cause for retrospective analysis, but also as an important moment for forecasting future developments in Europe. Our anniversary coincides with a number of other important dates, from the 20<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the organization of the first partially free elections in the USSR to the 20<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the revolutions in Eastern Europe and the fall of the Berlin Wall. As part of our celebration, we are holding a series of Diplomatic Evenings at the Center, at which ambassadors from different countries speak on the future of international relations.

The Carnegie Moscow Center's work is not limited to just research activities in Russia. Its staff also sees it as their mission to help the wider world gain a better understanding of Russia and what is happening here and promote the kind of dialogue between Russia and the West that would facilitate Russia's integration into the European community.

One of our most important new projects is the Euro-Atlantic Security Initiative (EASI), which aims to help develop a new inclusive security architecture that would overcome the differences between Russia and European institutions and take into account the military, political, economic and other interests of Russia and other countries not included in the Western community, while at the same time preserving the security achieved in Europe through the development and consolidation of European institutions over the last 20 years.

In 2010, the Carnegie Endowment for International Peace will mark its centennial. At the start of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, Andrew Carnegie believed that the world could be made a better place through the spread of knowledge and international cooperation. At the Carnegie Moscow Center we try to put these ideas into practice.

"FOR THE PAST 15 YEARS, IN GOOD TIMES AND BAD, CARNEGIE HAS BEEN THE PLACE WHERE BOTH RUSSIANS AND AMERICANS COULD GET TOGETHER AND TALK FRANKLY AND FREELY WITH EACH OTHER. WHEN OUR RELATIONSHIP WAS DIFFICULT, WHEN WE WERE TALKING AT EACH OTHER AND NOT WITH EACH OTHER, CARNEGIE PARTICIPANTS REMINDED US OF OUR COMMON INTERESTS AND HELPED GET THE RELATIONSHIP BACK ON TRACK."

JOHN BEYRLY  
U.S. AMBASSADOR TO RUSSIA

## The *New Vision*: the Center's tasks and principles



In 2007, the Carnegie Endowment announced its *New Vision* as the world's first international and ultimately global think tank. It implied the creation of a network of offices in various countries employing staffs of homegrown experts to study solutions to a wide range of pressing political, social and economic issues. The objective behind the new global positioning was to break through narrow national perceptions of the world, help people listen to each other and ensure that different points of view are heard. Alongside the office in Washington and the Carnegie Moscow Center, operations were added in Beijing, Beirut and Brussels.

The Carnegie Moscow Center has served as a model for the other Carnegie centers in the Carnegie Endowment's transformation into a global think tank. The *New Vision* has helped to strengthen the Center's place as a regional hub within the Endowment.

As a leading global think tank, the Endowment seeks to contribute to global security and prosperity. It is the Carnegie Moscow Center's task to ensure that Russia takes full part in global debates on these issues.

The Carnegie Moscow Center's mission is to:

- Contribute to improved U.S.-Russian relations, as well as Russia's relations with other countries, through greater knowledge in the world of Russia's policy interests, goals and developments, and vice versa;
- Embody and promote the concept of disinterested policy research and debate in Russia, the other post-Soviet states and Eurasia;
- Provide a neutral open forum for debate on the most pressing issues facing Russian and Eurasian development and international security;
- Foster intellectual cooperation between scholars and political experts in Russia, other countries of the former Soviet Union and other parts of the world to help find solutions for the most burning social and political issues.

In the words of the director of the Carnegie Moscow Center Dmitri Trenin, "the *New Vision* is an incentive for us to take a big step forward and start thinking and acting on a global scale. As part of the growing Carnegie family, the Carnegie Moscow Center will help influential voices in Russia, the new Eastern Europe, the Baltic region, the Caucasus and Central Asia to participate more actively in discussions at the global level, and at the same time it will get the Russian expert community involved in the debate on the global agenda." Our "area of responsibility" is Russia, the CIS countries, the Baltics and the entire Eastern and Central European region, as well as Russia's bilateral relations with other countries, including Japan, India, other Asian and Middle Eastern countries and so on.

In Moscow as in Washington, Carnegie as a global think tank continues to be defined by political independence and first-rate scholarship, combined with high-level experience in government and other sectors and a sharpened focus on real-world outcomes. As important as the expanded geographical presence it brings, the *New Vision* entails a commitment to developing innovative approaches to policy research all along the production chain from methodology to outreach, in order to bring envelope-pushing recommendations to decision makers in government, business, civil society and international institutions around the world. The Internet is an important tool, multiplying our ability to reach key audiences while engaging broader audiences in debates on global issues.

Global positioning implies international reach, knowledge sharing and exchange of information on best practices with the other Carnegie offices. The Carnegie Moscow Center teams Russian experts with researchers from all over the world – including Carnegie's centers in China, the Middle East and Europe – the Carnegie Moscow Center being no less important as a resource for Carnegie-Europe than the Washington headquarters.

The Think Tank Index, compiled by researchers at the University of Pennsylvania in 2009, named the Carnegie Moscow Center the best think tank in Russia and Eastern Europe.

The index, developed on the basis of a comprehensive survey of several thousand scholars and experts, was the first global rating of think tanks focusing on public policy, economics, social issues, security and ecology. The index placed the Carnegie Moscow Center top among 514 think tanks in Russia and Eastern Europe.

"I CAN'T THINK OF OTHER FOUNDATIONS THAT SHARE THIS APPROACH. THE FACT THAT CARNEGIE HAS TESTED AND DONE IN RUSSIA FOR SO LONG AND IS NOW BEGINNING TO ESTABLISH IN OTHER PARTS OF THE WORLD IS A VERY POSITIVE DEVELOPMENT."

KOFI ANNAN  
UN SECRETARY GENERAL (1997–2006)  
MEMBER OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
OF THE CARNEGIE ENDOWMENT  
FOR INTERNATIONAL PEACE

CARNEGIE  
ENDOWMENT  
GLOBAL  
OFFICES

WASHINGTON.  
CARNEGIE  
ENDOWMENT FOR  
INTERNATIONAL  
PEACE  
— 1910

MOSCOW.  
CARNEGIE  
MOSCOW  
CENTER  
— 1994

BEIJING.  
CARNEGIE  
BEIJING OFFICE  
— 2004

BEIRUT.  
CARNEGIE  
MIDDLE EAST  
CENTER  
— 2006

BRUSSELS.  
CARNEGIE-  
EUROPE  
— 2007

The Carnegie Moscow Center's research:  
"eternal spirit of the chainless mind..."



The Carnegie Moscow Center's primary focus is on the fundamental problems facing Russia today, alongside international policy issues, such as U.S.-Russian relations, the economic crisis, nuclear weapons proliferation and global climate change. Research is driven by the Center's programs and their respective chairs, each of whom develops their own annual and long-term agendas and budgets for studies, conferences, seminars and publications. With rigorous analysis and an open mind, we constantly seek to reach new audiences in Russia's expert community and the public at large.

Diverse viewpoints are brought to bear at roundtables and working group meetings held by the Center. Field research, including an ongoing program to monitor democratic

development in Russia's regions, as well as public opinion surveys conducted together with partner organizations, bring new facts and insight to the fore.

The Carnegie Moscow Center's Research Council comprises all of the Center's researchers, as well as select experts from outside the Center. Meetings of the Research Council provide an opportunity for lively debate on important issues of the day, including domestic and international affairs, such as nuclear disarmament, social and economic issues, the financial crisis and corruption. Presentations are made by Council members and invited speakers from other organizations.

The Carnegie Endowment for International Peace and the Carnegie Moscow Center do not propagate a consolidated position on issues of public importance, and the Center's scholars often espouse divergent views. The independence of its experts is one of the organization's founding principles: Carnegie experts are to be independent from the management, from official ideology, and even from each other. The Center's conferences, seminars and publications present the opinions not of the organization itself, but of the authors and speakers, and these opinions are not necessarily shared by their colleagues. But at the same time, we do share a set of common values based on liberal and democratic principles. The differences of opinion on tactical and sometime strategic issues are discussed constructively as part of our open dialogue, and while opinions may not change, the debate is nonetheless deepened.

As a think tank, the Carnegie Moscow Center is not involved in politics or advocacy. It is vitally important for us, however, that our research has public significance and

a practical dimension, and that its results can be realistically used to help find solutions to real problems. Our goal is that our work should help to produce visible improvement and that our efforts make a real contribution to rebuilding Russian-American relations, educating the public, and strengthening international security.

The results of our research are presented in the Center's publications, discussed at our own events and at conferences and seminars held by other organizations, which invite our experts to speak. In 2009, Carnegie Moscow Center scholars took part in more than 600 conferences and seminars, provided over 600 briefings and consultations to political and public figures and gave some 70 public lectures at universities. Many of our colleagues have taught abroad and currently teach at leading Russian universities such as Moscow State University, Moscow State Institute of International Relations (MGIMO) and the Higher School of Economics.

"THE CARNEGIE MOSCOW CENTER PLAYS A VERY IMPORTANT PART IN DEVELOPING AND SUPPORTING PROFESSIONAL COMMUNICATION BETWEEN ANALYTICS AND EXPERTS IN DOMESTIC AND FOREIGN POLICY, THE ECONOMY, REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT, THE SOCIAL SECTOR, AND IN THE SPHERE OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF NON-GOVERNMENTAL AND NON-PROFIT ORGANIZATIONS. THE NUMEROUS CONFERENCES, SEMINARS AND ROUNDTABLES AT THE CENTER ENABLE SPECIALISTS IN THESE FIELDS TO FREELY EXCHANGE OPINIONS, TAKE PART IN INTERDISCIPLINARY DISCOURSE AND JOINT DISCUSSIONS OF POSSIBLE FACTORS, FORECASTS AND SCENARIOS FOR DEVELOPMENTS IN OUR COUNTRY AND ABROAD, AND PROMOTE GREATER UNDERSTANDING OF THE VIEWS OF SPECIALISTS IN DIFFERENT FIELDS ON THE MAJOR PROBLEMS FACING RUSSIA AND THE GLOBALIZING WORLD. THE CARNEGIE MOSCOW CENTER HAS BECOME ONE OF THE FEW ORGANIZATIONS HELPING TO FORM A SET OF COMMON VALUES AND CRITERIA FOR ASSESSING PROFESSIONAL ACTIVITY IN RUSSIA'S EXPERT COMMUNITY."

VLADIMIR RIMSKY  
HEAD OF THE SOCIOLOGY DEPARTMENT  
INDEM FOUNDATION

## The Center's conferences and seminars: where East meets West



The Carnegie Moscow Center hosts seminars, conferences and lectures, roundtables and working groups. Meetings and discussions take place almost every day in the two conference rooms of the Center on Tverskaya Street, with a total of up to 150 events a year. Speakers at these events include our own experts, as well as prominent figures from Russia and its neighbors, the United States and other countries, representing a wide range of political views, from market-oriented liberals to statist conservatives and orthodox communists. The subjects addressed at the Center's conferences and seminars reflect the broad range of issues and challenges facing Russia and the world over the last 15 years, from resetting the U.S.-Russian relationship and developments in the post-Soviet space to solutions to the economic crisis and inter-ethnic conflicts to preventing the proliferation of nuclear weapons. The pace of events dwindles some-

what over the summer period and during the New Year holiday season, but then picks up again, sometimes up to several a day, often simultaneously in our two conference rooms.

Not long after we moved into the building on Tverskaya Street, the main conference room was outfitted with modern acoustic equipment. It now has a system with several microphones, and, since 2005, we have been able to make high-quality recordings of the events and post the audio files along with event news and texts of presentations on the Center's website. In 2008, video-broadcasting equipment was installed in the small conference room and is used actively for video-conferences with the Carnegie Endowment and the other Carnegie offices, as well as with journalists based in Washington.

#### Memorable events of the last 15 years

**1995** Meeting on citizenship issues with representatives from CIS countries

**1996** Conference: Rethinking U.S.–Russian Relations

Presentation by different Russian political parties of their platforms and daily press conferences in the run-up to and after Russia's presidential election

**1997** Roundtable with Madeleine Albright and Strobe Talbott on NATO Expansion and U.S.–Russia Relations

**1998** Conference: Social Policy at the Start of the Twenty-First Century

**1999** Strategic Forum Project. Russia and the EU Countries. EU Strategy Towards Russia

**2000** Moscow International Nonproliferation Conference

Presentation by different Russian political parties of their campaign platforms. Meeting of heads of foreign diplomatic missions and foreign media with Dmitry Medvedev who ran the electoral campaign for Vladimir Putin

**2001** Conference: The Cuban Missile Crisis and the Nuclear Risk Today

**2003** Second Moscow International Nonproliferation Conference

U.S.–Russian Energy Summit

**2004** Celebration of the Carnegie Moscow Center's 10<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Conference: Prospects for Russia

Many organizations have partnered with the Carnegie Moscow Center in joint research, events and publications, including: various institutes of the Russian Academy of Sciences, the PIR Center, the Liberal Mission Foundation, the Center for Economic and Financial Research at the New Economic School, the Institute for Urban Economics, the INDEM Foundation, the New Eurasia Foundation, the Institute of Contemporary Development (INSOR), the Moscow State Institute of International Relations (MGIMO), the Institute for the Economy in Transition, the Moscow School of Political Studies, the Gorbachev Foundation, the Russian Union of Industrialists and Entrepreneurs, the American Chamber of Commerce, the Brookings Institution, the RAND Corporation, the American Political Science Association, the James Baker Institute (United States), the Royal Institute of International Affairs (Chatham House – Britain), the Friedrich Ebert Foundation and the Heinrich Böll Foundation (Germany) and many others. We have gained from our cooperation with some of the big names in Moscow's research community, including the late Vladlen Martynov, Alexander Dynkin and Nodari Simonia from the Institute of World Economy and International Affairs (IMEMO), Sergei Rogov from the Institute of the U.S. and Canada of the Russian Academy of Sciences, Nikolay Shmelev from the Institute of Europe, Vitaly Naumkin from the Institute of Eastern Studies, Mikhail Titarenko from the Institute of the Far East, Ruslan Grinberg from the Institute of Economics and others.

Some of the most prominent politicians and experts from Russia and neighboring countries have spoken at the Carnegie Moscow Center, including Dmitry Medvedev, who at that time headed Vladimir Putin's election campaign; the first president of Kyrgyzstan Askar Akaev; foreign minister Sergei Lavrov; former Duma deputy and interior minister general Anatoly Kulikov; atomic energy minister Alexander Rumyantsev; foreign minister of Armenia Vardan Oskanian; presidential adviser on economic affairs Andrei Illarionov; head of the Alfa financial and industrial group Mikhail Fridman; presidential aide and at

that time head of the presidential administration's Expert Department Arkady Dvorkovich; Duma deputy and finance minister in 1997–1999 Mikhail Zadornov; president of the Liberal Mission Foundation and academic supervisor of the Higher School



of Economic Yevgeny Yasin; chairman of the Presidium of the Council on Foreign and Security Policy (SVOP) Sergei Karaganov; chairman of the board of the Institute for Contemporary Development Igor Yurgens; head of Yukos at the time Mikhail Khodorkovsky; the late director of Russia's leading public opinion research center Yury Levada; Russian liberals Irina Khakamada, Boris Nemtsov and Grigory Yavlinsky, who at that time headed two main Russian democratic parties, the Union of Right Forces (SPS) and Yabloko; then deputy chairman of the State Duma Committee on Constitutional Law and State-Building Alexei Mitrofanov; president of the Politika Foundation Vyacheslav Nikonov; the RF commissioner for human rights Vladimir Lukin; president of the Dynasty Foundation Dmitry Zimin; former general director of United Machine Building Plants and presently state minister of Georgia Kakha Bendukidze; deputy foreign minister of Azerbaijan Araz Azimov; world renowned Russian writer Vladimir Voynovich and prominent political scientist Andronik Migranyan.

The Carnegie Moscow Center's foreign guests over the years have included former British prime minister John Major; prince Turki al-Faisal (Saudi Arabia); former prime minister and foreign minister of Sweden Carl Bildt; U.S. energy secretary Samuel Bodman; U.S. secretaries of state Condoleezza Rice and Madeleine Albright; chairman of the U.S. Joint Chiefs of Staff Richard Meyers; special adviser to the secretary of state Strobe Talbott; assistant secretary of state for international security and nonproliferation Stephen G. Rademaker; assistant secretary of state John Bolton; then U.S. ambassador to Russia William Burns; director of the National Security Agency under the Reagan administration William Odom; former U.S. secretary of defense Robert McNamara; Norwegian foreign minister Jonas Gahr Store; U.S. undersecretary of defense for policy Eric Edelman; U.S. assistant secretary of state for European and Eurasian affairs Daniel Fried; Republican senator Richard Lugar, a member of the U.S. Senate's Committee on International Affairs; former attorney-general and foreign minister of Australia Gareth Evans; former Japanese foreign minister Yoriko Kawaguchi; the ambassadors of various countries to Moscow; member of the European Parliament and one of the authors of the EU constitution Daniel Cohn-Bendit; head of the Israeli Defense Ministry's missile defense organization Uzi Rubin; former chairman of the U.S. Defense Policy Board Advisory Committee Richard Perle; former under-secretary-general of the United Nations Marrack Goulding; former U.S. senator and co-chairman of the Nuclear Threat Reduction Initiative Sam Nunn; director of the EU-Russia Center in Brussels Fraser Cameron; and prominent historian and professor at New York University Alexander Yanov.

These meetings have provided Russian politicians, experts, businesspeople, diplomats, military officials, journalists and academics, representatives of different currents in contemporary Russian political life, with a unique chance to exchange views freely among themselves and with their foreign colleagues. People representing the broadest range of religious and political views take part in the Center's events. "Armenians and Azer-

**2005** Events dedicated to Russia's presidency of the G8: series of seminars and video-conferences with the participation of Rose Gottemoeller, Dmitri Trenin, Mark Medish and Andrew Kuchins

**2006** Energy Security Forum: series of conferences, seminars and roundtables and speech and press conference by U.S. secretary of energy Samuel Bodman

**2007** Celebration of the tenth anniversary of *Pro et Contra*, conference on the main subject of the issue, the power of oil and gas

Conference: The Successor's Burden

Series of roundtables as part of the Path to Europe project: with the participation of diplomats, foreign ministry representatives, experts and journalists from Estonia, Lithuania, Latvia, Poland, Hungary, the Czech Republic, Slovakia, Bulgaria, Romania, Slovenia, and East Germany

**2008** Festival marking the 200<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the establishment of U.S.–Russian diplomatic relations, including a symposium on the 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary of Russian-American scientific and cultural exchanges, a speech by Russian foreign minister Sergei Lavrov, and a roundtable on the 15<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Nunn-Lugar Program

Conference on corporate philanthropy, attended by members of the Carnegie Endowment's Board of Trustees

**2009** Video-conference in the run-up to Barack Obama's visit to Moscow with the participation of Dmitri Trenin, Lilia Shevtsova and James Collins

Live web-cast on the Carnegie Moscow Center's site of the speech at Carnegie-Europe by NATO secretary general Anders Fogh Rasmussen

Celebration of the Carnegie Moscow Center's 15<sup>th</sup> anniversary. Conference: 20 Years Without the Berlin Wall: Breaking Through to Freedom

baijanis, Ingush and Ossetians, Georgians and Abkhazians have all sat down together here,” says Alexey Malashenko. “Discussion has not always been easy, but as a rule, the representatives of the different sides in the conflicts have spoken with regret about the tragedies that have taken place. Only on one occasion did we have to actually separate the parties to the debate.”

Our Washington office also regularly hosts conferences and seminars with speakers from Russia, the CIS and other post-Soviet countries. Speakers at the Carnegie Endowment in Washington have included the presidents of the three Baltic states, Ukraine and Kyrgyzstan; former Russian prime minister and now director of the Institute for the Economy in Transition Yegor Gaidar; former Armenian prime minister turned opposition leader Aram Sargsyan; former Georgian prime minister Zurab Nogaideli; former Georgian prime minister and, for a period, acting president Nino Burdzhanadze; Russian foreign minister Sergei Lavrov; Russian finance minister Alexei Kudrin; foreign minister of Kyrgyzstan Kadyrbek Sarbaev; former ministers in the Kyrgyzstan government Askar Aitmatov and Edian Karabaev; the last Soviet foreign minister Alexander Bessmertnykh; Georgian foreign minister Grigol Vashadze; foreign minister of Kazakhstan Marat Tazhin; Russian ambassadors Sergei Kislyak and Yuri Dubinin; presidential adviser to Putin Mikhail Lesin; the RF commissioner for human rights Vladimir Lukin; member of the Russian Federation Council Mikhail Margelov; head of a major Russia industrial holding *Interros* Vladimir Potanin; president of the Supreme Arbitration Court

of Russia Anton Ivanov; Russian Constitutional Court judge from 1991 to 2002 Tamara Morshchakova; member of the Public Chamber of the Russian Federation Genri Reznik; speaker of the Ukrainian Parliament Vladimir Litvin; and other prominent political and public figures from Russia and neighboring countries.

“I CAN HARDLY IMAGINE INTELLECTUAL LIFE IN MOSCOW WITHOUT THE CARNEGIE MOSCOW CENTER. IT IS ONE OF THE VERY FEW ORGANIZATIONS THAT BRING TOGETHER THE HIGHEST POLITICAL AND INTELLECTUAL ELITES FROM AMERICA, EUROPE, AND RUSSIA TO DISCUSS THE CONTEMPORARY WORLD AND RUSSIA’S PLACE IN IT. IN RUSSIA’S TRANSITION TO A FREE AND CIVIL SOCIETY, THE ROLE OF THE CARNEGIE MOSCOW CENTER IS INVALUABLE.”

YELENA NEMIROVSKAYA  
DIRECTOR OF THE MOSCOW SCHOOL OF POLITICAL STUDIES

## The Carnegie Moscow Center and the media: always in the news



The Carnegie Moscow Center is a recognized newsmaker. If you drop into the Center on a weekday you will almost certainly see journalists with their sound equipment or TV cameras, plugging in their cables, getting their recording equipment ready, setting up the lighting. Articles and comments by Carnegie Moscow Center's experts are published or broadcast almost daily in the media in Russia and abroad.

Experts from the Carnegie Moscow Center also write regular columns in leading Russian and international media: Maria Lipman in *The Washington Post*, Nikolay Petrov in Russia's most popular English-language daily *The Moscow Times*, and Andrei Ryabov in Russia's leading Internet publication *Gazeta.Ru*.

Our scholars publish more than 200 articles and interviews in the Russian press and academic journals every year, more than 100 in the international media, and more than 1,000 commentaries in the Russian and foreign media. Experts from the Center are called on more and more often to comment on events, despite the not always favorable outside circumstances. “We have an easy time working with the press,” says Natalia Bubnova, deputy director responsible for communications at the Center. “We don’t have to think about how to attract journalists’ attention. They come to us themselves. This is in large part due to the ‘star quality’ of our scholars, who are among the best specialists in their fields and are rapidly accessible for journalists.” We try to put journalists directly in contact with the experts on the relevant subject, and their articles or comments are printed immediately.

“The independent position of our experts is particularly important today at a time when media commentators have lost a lot of their prestige,” says Andrei Ryabov. “What dominates in many media resources today is not commentary but propaganda posing as commentary, and ‘commentators’ are ready to give their views on any event or phenomenon at home or in the world, even if they are not very familiar with the subject.”

We organize press conferences and briefings for journalists and hold live video and Internet conferences. We send out press releases on the Center’s every new publication and on important Russian and international events to our regularly updated mailing lists. We do not advertise, but the leading news wires publish information on our events.

I BELIEVE THAT FOR THE MEDIA, CARNEGIE MOSCOW CENTER’S WORK IS AN EXCELLENT AND INSPIRING EXAMPLE OF HONESTY, OBJECTIVITY AND BALANCED ASSESSMENT. IT IS AN EXAMPLE OF IN-DEPTH ANALYSIS OF POLITICAL, ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL ISSUES. I THINK THIS IS WHY GLOBAL TELEVISION CHANNELS, PRINT MEDIA AND NEWS AGENCIES ALWAYS CALL ON EXPERTS FROM THE CARNEGIE MOSCOW CENTER TO COMMENT ON VARIOUS EVENTS IN INTERNATIONAL AND RUSSIAN LIFE. VOICE OF AMERICA IS ONE OF THESE MEDIA OUTLETS, AND I HOPE THAT THIS WILL ALSO MAKE AN IMPORTANT AND USEFUL CONTRIBUTION TO PROMOTING UNDERSTANDING AND DEVELOPING THE RUSSIAN-AMERICAN DIALOGUE.

VADIM MASSALSKY  
MOSCOW CORRESPONDENT  
VOICE OF AMERICA’S RUSSIAN SERVICE

## The Carnegie Moscow Center's website: new opportunities



The 15<sup>th</sup> anniversary has coincided with a transition of the Carnegie Moscow Center's website to a new platform. Along with offering a wealth of resources on Russian and international issues, it gives users the ability to harvest and manage information. Today the website is becoming one of the Center's primary tools of communication.

Every day, the site publishes articles and interviews by the Center's experts in Russian and English, reports on our events (along with documents from seminars, audio- and sometimes video recordings) and also contains the full texts of the Center's more than 400 publications, available to users free of charge. Information on programs, staff members and subjects "In the Carnegie Spotlight" is updated regularly. The Center's publications that appear in electronic version only are also all published on the website.

The website gives access to the Center's archives, unique in their size and the wealth of their content.

In 2007, the Carnegie Moscow Center established the new Regional Monitoring Site <http://monitoring.carnegie.ru>, which publishes monthly regional monitoring updates covering almost all of the Russia's federal districts, as well as reviews on issues such as the appointment of regional governors, local self-government reform, relations between the authorities and business, regional and federal elections, and relations between the federal and regional authorities.

The Center's website has begun devoting more space to news. Starting in 2009, we have been presenting daily commentary by our experts on the latest news and events on our home page. Our news coverage aims more at rapid response to events rather than trying to cover all of the news in general, puts the emphasis on individual style rather than following one set pattern, and seeks an incisive and polemical rather than an academic tone.

In the words of the site's editor, Anna Golubkova, who works with the various texts, "We try constantly to make the site more relevant and use the latest technologies such as RSS feeds and podcasting to give users greater opportunities for searching for and working with the site's content." The new technology also makes it possible to send more

information from our site to the sites of the Carnegie Endowment and our regional offices and vice versa. Since 2009, we have been broadcasting some of our video-conferences on the website. Starting in 2010, users will be able to discuss materials published on the site in the interactive format that has already been used by the Regional Monitoring website.

Washington's respected *National Journal* named the Center's website one of the ten best Internet resources on Russia. The number of site visits is constantly growing. We hope to use its uniquely abundant content and new technological possibilities to double the number of visitors over the next year.

"THE CARNEGIE MOSCOW CENTER SITE STANDS OUT FOR ITS RICH CONTENT AND UP-TO-DATE INFORMATION. IT COVERS THE HOTTEST TOPICS AND RESPONDS QUICKLY TO EVENTS WITH THE LATEST ARTICLES, INTERVIEWS AND WEB COMMENTARIES FROM THE SCHOLARS OF THE CENTER, AS WELL AS REPORTS ON THE CENTER'S EVENTS ATTENDED BY PROMINENT POLITICAL FIGURES – ALL POSTED ON A DAILY BASIS. THE WEBSITE IS VERY CONTEMPORARY, AND EASY TO NAVIGATE, THE LINKS ARE ALL ACTIVE, AND THERE IS AN OPTIMUM BALANCE BETWEEN TEXT AND PICTURES. THE QUALITY OF THE SITE'S TRANSLATIONS WILL ALSO KEEP ENGLISH-LANGUAGE USERS HAPPY."

ELENA MALANOVA  
UN DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

## The Carnegie Moscow Center's publications – strength in diversity



Publications, along with conferences and seminars, are one of the Center's main forms of activity and are the domain of our marketing manager, Veronica Lavrikova. Over its 15 years, the Carnegie Moscow Center has released some 500 publications of various sorts, including original and translated works: collections of essays, monographs, reference materials, books, brochures, Working Papers, Briefings and our quarterly journal *Pro et Contra*, totaling around 30 publications a year. They are all prepared on the basis of independent research carried out through the Center's programs, with our scholars involved either as authors or compilers and editors. Our publications cover a broad range of the most important issues in contemporary policy, including Russia's development and its place in the modern world, the role of civil society and religion in the post-Soviet space. Russia's relations with the United States and other countries, hot spots and ethnic

conflicts in the former Soviet republics, international security and nonproliferation of weapons of mass destruction.

During its early years, the Carnegie Moscow Center addressed the shortage of reference works in Russian by publishing materials on issues such as ethnic identity, the economy and Russia's relations with its neighbors, which were practically not covered in the literature available at the time.

One of the Center's important projects in the late 1990s was the publication of the three-volume *Russian Political Almanac*, which included political, social and economic data. The *U.S. Almanac* was used as a model, but whereas in the United States each new edition of the work simply updates and adds to the information contained in previous editions, in our case we had to collect all of the information from scratch.

We coordinate work with our colleagues at the Carnegie Endowment in Washington so that books that we think worth publishing in English are translated and published in Washington, closer to the English-speaking audience. Our books have also been published in many other countries including: China, Poland, Latvia, Saudi Arabia, Syria, Britain, Germany, Italy, the United States and Canada.

“THE CARNEGIE MOSCOW CENTER'S PUBLICATIONS ARE AUTHORITATIVE AND INFORMATIVE AND HELP US IN OUR WORK.”

PRESS SERVICE OF THE GOVERNOR OF THE KRASNODAR REGION

“ALL THE DIPLOMATS WORKING IN MOSCOW RECOMMEND THAT I TURN TO THE CARNEGIE MOSCOW CENTER, AS IT IS THE BEST PLACE IN MOSCOW FOR PUBLICATIONS AND CONFERENCES.”

RAMBLEY YATIM  
COUNCILOR OF THE EMBASSY OF MALAYSIA

In 2005, the Carnegie Moscow Center began publishing books in partnership with major Russian presses, selected through tenders. Thus, the publishing houses distribute our books commercially, while delivering a certain number to the Center for our own use, allowing to achieve higher print-runs at lower cost and keeping readers better informed about our books, which are now available in bookstores, catalogues, on the Internet and at Russian and international book fairs.

We have also recently begun publishing series of books, the first of which is a collection titled *Religion in Eurasia*, published jointly with ROSSPEN Publishing House.

The Carnegie Moscow Center also publishes Working Papers and Briefings. The materials that the Center publishes as part of the Working Papers series give our readers timely access to the latest studies on domestic and foreign policy issues in Russia and the Eurasian region. The series publishes either interim results of studies or papers worthy of readers' immediate attention.

The Center's Briefings cover topical issues in Russian and international policy. They are intended for specialists and policymakers, as well as for a more general readership. The Briefings are based on research carried out by the Center and contain analytical conclusions and practical recommendations on different aspects of Russian domestic and foreign policy, economic policy and security. The Briefings are generally written by the Center's experts and in some cases by specialists visiting the Center.

In recent years we have also begun publishing reports, a timely and attractive way to bring readers relatively short texts. We have also begun releasing an increasing number of publications exclusively in electronic form, distributed freely by email and through the Center's website.

Carnegie's publications give policymakers in Washington and Moscow an opportunity to see the world from a new angle rather than solely from the perspective presented



in the local media or by their country's think tanks. We take into account global viewpoints, not only Russian and American, but also European, Middle Eastern and Asian. This helps give shape to a more complex, but also more adequate picture of the world.

The Carnegie Moscow Center's publications are distributed at our presentations and seminars and sent out free of charge to major universities and libraries in Russia, Russian and international research centers and think tanks, media outlets, state bodies and public organizations. We try to organize rapid and targeted distribution of our publications. In the words of Veronica Lavrikova, "We give readers a unique chance to be the first to learn the views of leading experts on the most topical issues and do all we can to get these views to the public as rapidly and efficiently as possible." Each year we participate with a stand at the Moscow International Non/Fiction Book Fair and Exhibition, Russia's main annual event for intellectual literature. We host presentations for our newly published books at the Center itself, as well as at Moscow's major bookshops and book clubs such as Biblio-Globus, Dom Knigi, and Bilingva. The full texts of all publications since 1998 are available on the Carnegie Moscow Center's website, [www.carnegie.ru](http://www.carnegie.ru).



### PRO ET CONTRA – APPROACHING 15 YEARS

Our journal *Pro et Contra*, devoted to topical Russian and international issues and published quarterly, has built up a reputation as one of Russia's leading political periodicals and, independent specialists attest, is the leading journal publishing expert assessments. The journal was founded soon after the Center itself and will soon celebrate its 15<sup>th</sup> anniversary, too. It marked its 10<sup>th</sup> anniversary in 2006 by holding a conference with leading Russian and foreign experts and academics, as well as members of the diplomatic, political and business communities.

The journal's founder and first chief editor was prominent essayist and political analyst Marina Pavlova-Silvanskaya, and its current chief editor is Maria Lipman, a well-known journalist and specialist on domestic policy and civil society issues, who often contributes articles and comments to Russian and foreign media and writes *Pro et Contra*'s editor's column.

A makeover in 2005 gave *Pro et Contra* a more modern design and brought it a wider readership, which alongside members of the expert community and politicians now also includes readers in private business, young professionals and broad range of people interested in domestic and foreign policy issues. The journal's nearly 4,000 subscribers in 100 cities around Russia and abroad span different generations, political views and social backgrounds. Some readers have subscribed to the journal ever since the first issue and say it has always managed to maintain the highest academic standards over these 15 years. At the same time, new subscribers sign up regularly, demonstrating that *Pro et Contra* remains topical, popular and in demand.

"WE HAVE ALWAYS ADMIRERD *PRO ET CONTRA* EDITORS' ABILITY TO FOCUS ON WHAT REALLY IS THE ISSUE OF THE DAY. NOT YESTERDAY'S ISSUE, WHEN THE EDITORIAL PLAN WAS MADE, BUT TODAY'S, WHEN THE JOURNAL REACHES ITS READERS."

NEPRIKOSNOVENNY ZAPAS  
No 4 (66), 2009

The journal publishes articles by prominent Russian and foreign specialists, international experts, political analysts, economists and sociologists. As a forum for free discussion on key aspects of modern public life, *Pro et Contra* offers readers a diverse analysis of domestic and foreign policy, the economy, international relations, public life and political institutions. Russian themes are examined in the broader international context.



Issues over recent years have addressed such hot subjects as the situation in Afghanistan and Russia's position, the economic crisis and its impact on the political situation and regional politics in Russia, internal political processes in Iran, new forms of civic activism in Russia, elections and the political system in the world and in Russia, the evolution of the world order and Russia's and China's

place in it, the results of Vladimir Putin's presidency, the formation of a civic national identity in Russia, the evolution of U.S.-Russian relations, local self-government, and conflicts on the post-Soviet territory and possible ways for their resolution.

Conferences and presentations are held on the main topics of the various issues, bringing together not only the authors and regular guests at the Carnegie Moscow Center, but also other leading Russian and foreign experts.

All of the journal's issues since 1998 can be found on the Carnegie Moscow Center's website, including the full texts of articles in Russian and abstracts in English. Some issues have been translated into English and have also been published on the websites of the Carnegie Moscow Center and the Carnegie Endowment in Washington.

### THE CARNEGIE NEWSLETTER – A WINDOW ON THE WORLD

Publication of the electronic *Carnegie Newsletter* began in the autumn of 2005. It is prepared each month in Russian and English and sent out to a large number of subscribers in Russia and abroad. This electronic newsletter contains a brief list of the publications and events at the Carnegie Moscow Center and the other Carnegie offices and is tied in to the most important public and political events in Russian and international life. You can subscribe to the *Carnegie Newsletter* on the Center's website at [www.carnegie.ru/ru/subscription-info.htm](http://www.carnegie.ru/ru/subscription-info.htm).

"WE HAVE PROCESSED ALL THE PAST ISSUES OF PRO ET CONTRA FOR OUR ELECTRONIC LIBRARY. WHEN WE TESTED THE UPLOAD WE COULD NOT RESIST THE TEMPTATION TO READ THE ARTICLES, AND WE HAVE BEEN PLEASED TO SEE THE HIGH STANDARD THAT YOU MAINTAIN AT THE JOURNAL."

TATYANA YUDINA  
PROJECT DIRECTOR  
UNIVERSITY INFORMATION SYSTEM (UIS)

## The Carnegie Moscow Center's programs

### Foreign Policy and Security



One of the program's main focuses is on the issues facing Euro-Atlantic security. It examines new ideas to help overcome differences between Russia and the West on problems such as NATO expansion, the situation in the Caucasus following the Georgian conflict, the deployment of missile defenses in Europe, and energy security. A European security system that does not include Russia cannot hope to be stable. Russia's integration into a common security system is also essential for its effective integration into the global economy, for its internal modernization and for its engagement with the global community in a way that benefits all involved. The Carnegie Moscow Center holds active discussions on this subject with Russian Security Council representatives, members of the Federation Council, officials from the Foreign Ministry and Defense Ministry, experts of the Russian Academy of Sciences and Russian think tanks, Russian and foreign armed forces representatives,

and journalists. In cooperation with the Carnegie Brussels office we also organize meetings and conferences in various European countries. This issue also made it onto the agenda of the conference marking the Center's 15<sup>th</sup> anniversary and the 20<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the fall of the Berlin Wall.

"We need a genuine strategic dialogue," says Carnegie Moscow Center director Dmitri Trenin who chairs the Foreign Policy and Security program. "I think that Russia urgently needs it, too. Yet recognition of Russia's role will be closely linked to the need for Moscow to learn how to take responsibility and build up its experience at joint action. So far, the West has often looked at Russia more in ideological or theological terms, but seldom in strategic terms. Serious dialogue with Russia would encourage the Americans and Europeans to start thinking about Russia strategically."

#### Recent publications:

*Twenty Years After the Wall Fell: A Breakthrough to Freedom* (in Russian and English, 2010)

Dmitri Trenin, ed.

*Solo Voyage* (in Russian)

Dmitri Trenin

*Post-Imperium: Russia and Its Neighbors*

(in English, 2010)

Dmitri Trenin

*Getting Russia Right* (in English)

Dmitri Trenin

*The End of Eurasia: Russia on the Border Between Geopolitics and Globalization* (in English)

Dmitri Trenin

*Integration and Identity: Russia as the "New West"* (in Russian)

Dmitri Trenin

*Russia's Role in Europe* (in Russian and English)

Sven Hirdman

*The Landscape of Russian Foreign Policy Decision Making* (in English)

Dmitri Trenin and Bobo Lo

#### Key achievements

When tensions in relations were exacerbated and official channels of communication proved insufficient, Carnegie provided a platform that filled the gap in contacts and helped create greater understanding between Russia and the United States and Russia and the West in general. Non-governmental organizations' efforts helped to bring the two governments' positions closer together.

Activities on this program are carried out in cooperation with the Carnegie offices in Washington, Brussels, Beijing and Beirut. Many of the Carnegie Moscow Center's researchers are also involved in research on foreign policy issues, including Lilia Shevtsova, Alexei Arbatov, Maria Lipman, Vladimir Dvorkin, Alexey Malashenko, Sam Greene, Natalia Bubnova and Peter Topychkanov, as well as colleagues in Washington: director of the Russia-Eurasia program James Collins and Martha Olcott.

Another important area of the program's work is Russia's relations with neighboring countries. "One of the reasons why Russia has problems in its relations with Europe is that it is not ready to understand neighboring countries," emphasizes Dmitri Trenin. "Russia will not have good relations with Europe unless it learns to understand Poland, Estonia and Latvia. The stereotype common here about a 'power center' headed by Moscow and the clichés about 'Russian imperialism' widespread in the West do not reflect the situation quite adequately and do not help us to move forward." The program draws up recommendations aimed at fostering greater understanding between the various sides and overcoming competition between Russia and the West in Eastern Europe, the South Caucasus and Central Asia.

#### EXPERTS:

DMITRI  
TRENIN

ALEXEI  
ARBATOV

LILIA  
SHEVTSOVA

NATALIA  
BUBNOVA

SAM  
GREENE

ALEXEY  
MALASHENKO

MARIA  
LIPMAN

PETER  
TOPYCHKANOV

## The Carnegie Moscow Center's programs

### Russian Domestic Policy and Political Institutions



This program, chaired by senior associate Lilia Shevtsova, analyzes current political events and long-term trends in Russia's political development, with a particular focus on the evolution of political leadership and the political regime in Russia. The program's focus has been changing along with the situation in the country. Lilia Shevtsova and her colleagues have devoted more attention in recent years to comparative analysis of post-communist systems and the links between domestic and foreign policy and between politics and the economy. "You cannot make sense of developments inside Russia in isolation from the international context and without also studying how the issues of power and ownership intertwine," Shevtsova says. Examination of the factors that affect Russia's stability and determine its potential for transformation is an important part of the program's work.

Analysis of Russia's political life also dispels common myths and clichés in Russia and the West regarding Russia's development. "We have to turn to recent history, too, and rethink the present," notes Shevtsova. "Too often we have simplified reality and sometimes it is hard to abandon our errors and admit our mistakes, but only in this way can we understand what is taking place in our country and society."

The program has published a number of monographs and collections of essays in Russian and English on Russia's post-communist transition, the Yeltsin and Putin periods, the particularities of Russia's political regime, and the development of political systems in Central and Eastern Europe. These have included: *The Lonely Power. Why Russia Has Not Become the West and Why the West Is Difficult for Russia*; *Russia – Lost in Transition. The Yeltsin and Putin Legacies*; *Putin's Russia* and *Yeltsin's Russia: Challenges and Constraints*. The program has also produced dozens of articles and essays for the international media and leading analytical journals.

The program carries out joint projects with research organizations in other countries: in the United States, the Baltic states, Poland, Scandinavia, Britain, Germany, France and Austria. Lilia Shevtsova also works together with the Royal Institute of International Affairs (Chatham House, London) and the Institute for Human Sciences (Vienna/Boston).

Together with the Liberal Mission Foundation, the program carried out the Path to Europe project, which over several years studied Central and Eastern European countries' experience in transforming their societies. Politicians, public figures, diplomats and foreign ministry officials from these countries took part in discussions, the conclusions of which were

published on the Center's website and analyzed in the monograph *Path to Europe*, providing Russia with its first systematic study of the transition of the former communist countries of Europe. "This was the most fascinating project," recalls Shevtsova. "We discussed the development issues facing the different Eastern European countries with these countries' representatives. The discussions were amazingly intensive, sometimes going on for 6-8 hours without a break. I hope that the reform experience our guests told us about will be of interest to the Russian audience."

The magazine *Foreign Policy* has listed Lilia Shevtsova as one of the world's top 100 public intellectuals. She heads the Russia Global Agenda Council at the Davos International Economic Forum. The Council discusses the main issues in Russia's development and the possibilities for Russia's greater integration into global processes. Lilia Shevtsova also participates in discussions on Russian issues at permanent forums, such as Women for International Security (WIIS), and is a member of this group's executive committee.

Carnegie Moscow Center experts Nikolay Petrov and Andrei Ryabov take part in the program, working actively on various aspects of Russian domestic political life. "I cannot even imagine how we could get by without close and friendly cooperation with our colleagues," Shevtsova says. "The professional understanding between us and sense of camaraderie are probably our greatest strengths." The studies the program produces are widely used by the diplomatic corps, journalists and universities in Russia and abroad to examine the development processes underway in Russia today.

#### EXPERTS:

LILIA  
SHEVTSOVA

NIKOLAY  
PETROV

ANDREI  
RYABOV

#### Recent publications:

*The Lonely Power: Why Russia Has Not Become the West and Why the West Is Difficult for Russia* (in Russian and English, 2010)  
Lilia Shevtsova

*Russia – Lost in Transition. The Yeltsin and Putin Legacies* (in English)  
Lilia Shevtsova

*Path to Europe. Estonia, Lithuania, Latvia, Poland, Hungary, Czech Republic, Slovakia, Bulgaria, Romania, Slovenia, and East Germany* (in Russian)  
Igor Klyamkin and Lilia Shevtsova, eds.

*Putin's Russia. Revised Edition* (in English)  
Lilia Shevtsova

*The Rise and Fall of Parliament: Watershed Years in Russian Politics (1985–1993)*. In two volumes (in Russian)  
Victor Sheynis

*Gorbachev, Yeltsin, and Putin: Political Leadership in Russia's Transition* (in English)  
Lilia Shevtsova and Archie Brown, eds.

#### Key achievements

Creating a platform for studying the long-term trends and possible development scenarios in Russia from a liberal perspective.

## The Carnegie Moscow Center's programs

### Nonproliferation



This program's primary objective over these 15 years has been to facilitate dialogue inside Russia and between Russia and the United States on issues concerning the nonproliferation of weapons of mass destruction. It has studied the problems related to the Iranian and North Korean nuclear programs, possible scenarios of how terrorists could get their hands on nuclear weapons, and measures to prevent such events from taking place. The program's team includes leading Russian experts on disarmament issues: its chair, Alexei Arbatov, corresponding member of the Russian Academy of Sciences, and major-general (retired) Vladimir Dvorkin. The program coordinator, Peter Topychkanov, is also an expert in the field.

Bilateral and multilateral dialogue on nuclear disarmament is now taking center stage. "Nuclear disarmament is not utopia but a realistic goal, even if for a more distant

future, and we need to work towards it now.” says Alexei Arbatov. “Nuclear disarmament is a more effective guarantee for countries’ security than increasing arms stock-

piles.” The program examines a whole range of issues related to disarmament: strategic doctrines, missile defense, conventional weapons, space weapons, third countries’ nuclear weapons, and nonproliferation regimes and mechanisms. The program also identifies and analyzes problems that the nuclear disarmament process could pose for specific countries, in particular for Russia. Such problems need to be brought to the attention of the authorities and the general public, including those in Europe and the United States, through constructive dialogue. Regular meetings, conferences and seminars with the participation of government officials, members of the expert community and the media are organized to discuss these issues.

The program has produced four reports on nonproliferation issues in specific regions: South Asia, Northeast Asia and the Greater Middle East, as well as a fundamental work *Nuclear Weapons after the Cold War* (published in Russian and English), and a series of books on various areas of military-technological development that pose the greatest threats: new weapons technologies, bioterrorism, and space weapons. The focus of the program’s new book project (in Russian and English 2010) is on *Resetting U.S.-Russian Nuclear Relations*. Several new Briefings and articles issued by the program are dedicated to topical disarmament issues such as the replacement for the START-1 treaty, missile defense, the buildup of upgraded conventional weapons, and third countries’ nuclear weapons.

#### Recent publications:

*Resetting U.S.-Russia Nuclear Relations (in Russian and English), 2010*

Alexei Arbatov and Vladimir Dvorkin, eds.

*Outer Space: Weapons, Diplomacy and Security (in Russian and English)*

Alexei Arbatov and Vladimir Dvorkin, eds.

*Nuclear Proliferation: New Technologies, Weapons, and Treaties (in Russian and English)*

Alexei Arbatov and Vladimir Dvorkin, eds.

*Combating Bioterrorism: Political, Technological, and Legal Issues (in Russian)*

Alexei Arbatov, ed.

*At the Nuclear Threshold: The Lessons of North Korea and Iran for the Nuclear Non-proliferation Regime (in Russian and English)*

Alexei Arbatov, ed.

*Nuclear Weapons After the Cold War (in Russian and English)*

Alexei Arbatov and Vladimir Dvorkin, eds.

#### Key achievements

Providing a comprehensive analysis of the whole range of issues related to preventing the proliferation of nuclear weapons and their delivery means. Multilateral examination of the various aspects of the practical implementation of nuclear disarmament objectives.

#### EXPERTS:

ALEXEI  
ARBATOV

VLADIMIR  
DVORKIN

PETER  
TOPYCHKANOV



## The Carnegie Moscow Center's programs

### Society and Regions



This program is chaired by Nikolay Petrov and coordinated by Alexei Titkov, both leading experts on regional issues and civil society. Center associates contributing to the program also include Maria Lipman, Andrei Ryabov, Sam Greene and Alexey Malashenko. The program studies the interconnected economic and socio-political development of Russia's regions and the current state of civil society in Russia. An "inventory" of the latter is taken by program experts, identifying trends and prospects for the consolidation of civil society and factors promoting or hindering its development.

The program puts particular emphasis on elections as one of the most important democratic institutions. Elections at both the federal and regional level have always been a traditional subject for analysis at the Carnegie Moscow Center. The Center's experts study

electoral systems and practices, above all at the regional level, as well as in other post-communist countries, in particular Ukraine.

The program's work during the elections in 1996 and 2000 was particularly interesting. The Center invited representatives of all of the different political parties to present their campaign platforms at the Center. As Nikolay Petrov recalls, "In the spring and summer of 1996, we held weekly press conferences for the media, and on election night the whole place was buzzing and we were all watching the results coming in live from the campaign headquarters on the big screen and celebrating..." In 2000, one of the Center's guests was Dmitry Medvedev, who at that time headed Vladimir Putin's campaign.

Starting in 2005, the program began ongoing monitoring of the socio-political development of Russia's regions. Monitoring initially covered nine regions, then ten. It now covers almost all of Russia's seven federal districts, has established a network to collect data from regional experts, and developed a unique methodology for recording and processing the information collected. The aim of this monitoring is to follow the development of Russian society at the regional level, identify and analyze new trends and regional particularities in national patterns, and spot the emergence of new forms of activism and local institutions. The monitoring data are published on the Center's website, and since 2007, on the dedicated regional monitoring website Russian Society: Regional Dynamics <http://monitoring.carnegie.ru>. The regional monitoring site was developed in-house and is only in Russian, yet the daily updated information that it offers is accessible to a wide range of specialists in Russia and abroad. The site's interactive interface allows users to ask questions and take part in discussions on regional issues.

Regional monitoring has become even more important with the global economic crisis, which has provoked seismic shifts in the economic, political and social landscapes of Russia's regions that are difficult to ascertain from outside the regions themselves. Grassroots

#### Recent publications:

*Irregular Triangle: Power-Business-Society*  
(in Russian)

Nikolay Petrov and Alexei Titkov, eds.

*Pathways of Russian Post-Communism* (in Russian)

Andrei Ryabov and Maria Lipman, eds.

*"Uniqueness" Instead of Modernization: Paradoxes of Russian Politics in the Post-Stabilization Era*  
(in Russian)

Andrei Ryabov

*Working Papers: "Revival of 'Feudal' Archaism in Modern Russia: Practice and Ideas"* (in Russian), No 4, 2008

Andrei Ryabov

*Briefing: "Governors' Appointments: First Year Results"* (in Russian), April 2006

Nikolay Petrov

*Briefing: "Press Freedom in a Managed Democracy"* (in Russian), March 2006

Maria Lipman

monitoring is combined with analytical activities "from above:" issuing "regional health ratings," conducting Internet conferences on important events with the participation of experts from respective regions, and holding regular briefings for Russian and foreign journalists. In cooperation with the Russian Union of Industrialists and Entrepreneurs, field trips are organized to the regions and the results are used to prepare monographs on the relationship between the authorities, society and business. Alexey Malashenko, who works on another Carnegie program, has also taken part in these trips. What surprises Nikolay Petrov's colleagues is that wherever he goes in the regions, be it Irkutsk, Orenburg or Astrakhan, he is always at home and people know him "as well as the governor," quote him, seek advice from him and are always ready to help him.

For several years, the program has been studying possible scenarios for Russia's future. These studies are now being tied into the work on the issues raised by the crisis and the transformation of the political system and political institutions. In our work in these areas we make use of the advantages offered by our position as a global organization that can draw on the experience of different countries and regions. Involving specialists from different disciplines

also gives us the ability to conduct integrated analysis of all aspects of the investigated topics, including economics, politics and governance.

Two working groups have been set up as part of the program: on development scenarios and on civil society. There is increasing cooperation with Russian and international think

## EXPERTS:

NIKOLAY PETROV

MARIA  
LIPMANALEXEI  
TITKOV

tanks and research centers working in these areas, such as MGIMO, INSOR, the Brookings Institution and the Energy Research Group, as well as with the Center's other programs and other Carnegie offices.

The program studies the mechanisms of the so-called "managed" or "sovereign" democracy and the existing clans and elites, as well as the forms of independent activity by the public and civic initiative or grassroots democracy.

Cooperation with the business community is also growing. We are studying the mood and behavior of business in different regions and have agreements with the heads of major companies and business associations on organizing joint events and expert meetings with business representatives, often in cooperation with our colleagues at the Washington central office and Carnegie-Europe in Brussels.

## Key achievements

The regional program has launched and manages a regional socio-economic and political monitoring system, including a core of experts in Moscow and around the country who have been working with the Carnegie Moscow Center for a number of years. Based on nationwide studies and regional cases, the program has compiled and published numerous materials on the present condition and future potential of Russia in general, as well as on its regions, federalism, elections and the varied challenges to regional development. Numerous conferences and seminars have been held in the capital and in other Russian cities.

## Religion, Society and Security



The program focuses above all on socio-political developments in the Muslim regions of Eurasia. The program is co-chaired by Alexey Malashenko in Moscow and Martha Olcott in Washington, with assistance from the program coordinator, Kristina Kudlaenko. Peter Topychkanov, coordinator of another program, is an expert in this field as well, with particular focus on Pakistan and India.

Over the last 15 years, the program has studied the emergence of new countries in the post-Soviet space, with special attention to the role that religion, ethnicity and other socio-cultural factors have played in this process. In recent years the program has addressed the following topics:

- the influence of Islam on the social and political evolution of the post-Soviet societies of Central Asia, the countries of the Caucasus and Russia;
- the influence of nationalism on social processes;
- the sustainable development of the oil-producing states of the Caspian region and the formation of political and economic elites in post-Soviet countries;
- conflicts in the post-Soviet space.

“This program has always kept us working on conflicts,” says Alexey Malashenko. “Sometimes we found ourselves in the center of the storm. In Kyrgyzstan we got caught up in Operation Foreigner, as a result of which two of our colleagues from Uzbekistan were seized. We had to appeal to the country’s leaders to get them freed. We spent ten hours on the border between North Ossetia and Ingushetia. They did not want to let us cross. In Dagestan we personally measured the depth of wahhabite trenches. And of course, we have made many visits to Chechnya. I was present at each of the elections there.”

Problems in Afghanistan and Iran have added to the program’s work over recent years. Two working groups were set up together with the Foreign Policy and Security program, and are the focus of new brochures and Working Papers on these subjects.

#### EXPERTS:

ALEXEY  
MALASHENKO

MARTHA  
OLCOTT  
(WASHINGTON)

PETER  
TOPYCHKANOV

Religion has always been in the program’s spotlight. Seminars on the influence of religion in Eurasia have been held regularly for the last six years. The changes taking place are analyzed from the angle of Russia’s policies in the Muslim world. Considerable attention is given to studying Islam and its radical and reformist currents, as well as to the issue of religious education. We have published Alexey Malashenko’s monographs *The Islamic Alternative and the Islamist Project* and *Russia and Islam*. The program also undertakes comparative analysis of radical Islamist trends in the Caucasus and Central Asia, looking at them in reference to similar currents in countries further afield. The result of all this work is a series of books called *Religion in Eurasia*. Three books in the series have already been published: *Religion and Globalization*, *Religion and Conflict* and *Twenty Years of Religious Freedom*. The fourth book project focuses on *Orthodox Christianity in the Post-Soviet Space* which has seen its role increase since the crisis began, partly as a result of the Orthodox Church’s deliberate policies, a development that has met with a mixed response from representatives of Islam, one of Russia’s other main religions.

Particular attention is given to the stability of Central Asian political regimes and new socio-political trends in the region. The program’s research aims to identify the key trends in various aspects of the region’s public and political life and explore the most significant current events. This is especially important during a period of economic crisis; with its weak economies and high unemployment, Central Asia is particularly vulnerable to the crisis, and this could lead to upheaval and attempts by individual clans and political groups to start competing to increase their influence. In this respect, one of the program’s aims is to provide forecasts about where in the region radical Islamist movements might provoke another uprising, which, if supported by the local population and the Afghanistan-based Taliban, could seriously destabilize the situation.

#### Recent publications:

- Twenty Years of Religious Freedom in Russia* (in Russian)  
Alexey Malashenko and Sergei Filatov, eds.
- Ramzan Kadyrov. The Chechen Version of Russian Authoritarianism* (in Russian)  
Alexey Malashenko
- Religion and Globalization Across Eurasia* (in Russian)  
Alexey Malashenko and Sergei Filatov, eds.
- Religion and Conflict* (in Russian)  
Alexey Malashenko and Sergei Filatov, eds.
- Russia and Islam* (in Russian)  
Alexey Malashenko.
- The Islamic Alternative and the Islamist Project* (in Russian)  
Alexey Malashenko
- How They Voted in Chechnya* (in Russian)  
Alexey Malashenko
- Central Asia’s Second Chance* (in Russian and English)  
Martha Brill Olcott
- Civil Society in Multi-Ethnic and Poly-Confessional Regions* (in Russian)  
Alexey Malashenko, ed.
- Working Papers: “Russia and the Muslim World”* (in Russian and English), No 3, 2008  
Alexey Malashenko
- Briefing: “Losing the Caucasus”* (in Russian and English), August 2009  
Alexey Malashenko

“Our program is full of adventures,” says Alexey Malashenko. “We have driven across, walked across and even sailed across countless borders, between Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan and Turkmenistan, Kyrgyzstan and Uzbekistan, Ossetia and Ingushetia, Ingushetia and Chechnya. And we have made countless flights on domestic airlines, including in some completely archaic planes.”

We continue to follow social and political developments in the North Caucasus, where the situation is as tense as ever and is riddled by an unending series of conflicts. Instability in the North Caucasus is one of the defining factors in Russia’s domestic politics as well, and has an impact on the country’s foreign policy. The program studies the negative effects the crisis has had on the situation in the region, worsening the local economic situation, aggravating inter-ethnic conflicts and leading to a rise in the activity of radical Islamist groups that are spreading their influence ever further afield. It also investigates the intensifying struggle between the different ethnic and political groups in the region, analyzes the spread of Islam in the North Caucasus and investigates the cultural drift of the ethnically non-Russian regions away from federal control. The Center’s experts continue to closely follow developments in Chechnya, including the signs of an emerging civil society.

Social and political issues related to the Sochi Olympics are also examined in the context of the general situation in the Caucasus. The 2014 Sochi Olympics are seen as a stabilizing factor and an incentive for development in three of Russia’s Caucasian republics: Kabardino-Balkaria, Karachayevo-Cherkessia and Adygeya.

We study developments in Georgia and discuss issues related to Abkhazia and South Ossetia. This work is based on a comprehensive examination of the current situation and incorporates multiple perspectives.

Our natural partner in work on this program is the Carnegie Middle East Center in Beirut. Our work together focuses on Islam-related issues and the influence of Middle Eastern Islamist groups on the Muslim community in Eurasia, in particular in Russia and Central Asia. Martha Olcott and Alexey Malashenko work with the Carnegie Middle East Center and organize joint conferences and publications.

#### Key achievements

For 15 years we have been about the only Russian center studying the current situation in religion and one of the world’s leading centers for the study of Central Asia and the Caucasus. The program’s achievements also include deeper understanding of developments in the Islamic World.

## The Carnegie Moscow Center's programs

### Economic policy



The program's objective is to study the economic situation in Russia. Over the past 15 years it has covered a broad range of aspects of the country's transition. The program's successive chairpersons – all leading professionals in their field – led research on Russia's economic reforms and development from a variety of different angles, which allowed to cover a broad range of issues. Under the direction of Mikhail Dmitriev, the program examined administrative reform. During Sergey Vasiliev's time as chairman, the work focused on financial market and banking sector issues, as well as stabilization projects. Dmitri Vasiliev paid particular attention to pension reform, and Yevgeny Gavrilentov focused on corporate governance and international finance, including their Russian permutations. Tatyana Maleva put the emphasis on studying the social sector and the problems facing small and medium-size businesses,

and Ksenia Yudaeva, whom many consider one of the best among the new generation of Russian macroeconomists, devoted primary attention to Russia's accession to the WTO, evaluating the effectiveness of reforms and the state's increasing intervention in the economy.

In 2007–2008, when Nina Poussenkova chaired the program, the main focus was on the problems affecting Russia's oil and gas sector. Analysis was conducted of previously little-studied regional aspects of oil and gas industry development, relations between the federal and regional authorities in the energy sector, the reciprocal influence of regions' energy sectors and their social, economic and political development, cooperation between the main players in the hydrocarbons market, including the oil and gas majors and their contribution to strategic decision-making at the regional level, and the problems and outlook for developing Russia's eastern regions as a new oil and gas frontier that could “open a window” to Asia.

In autumn 2009, Sergei Aleksashenko, former deputy chairman of the Russian Central Bank and one of Russia's most well-known and influential economists, joined the program as an expert. The program's coordinator Anna Bessonova also works on independent studies and publishes the results of her research on various economic issues.

Under Aleksashenko's leadership, the program explores Russia's integration into the global economy and the Russian economy's recovery from the crisis. Thorough study is made of the causes of the crisis and its potential long-term consequences for the country, as well as the measures taken by the Russian government to stabilize the situation. Public opinion surveys are used as a reference for making forecasts on how the evolving situation will affect Russians' lives, and the program examines possible development scenarios for the medium-term perspective.

#### Recent publications:

*Comparative Analysis of Stabilization Programs of the 1990's (in Russian)*

Sergey Vasiliev, ed.

*Building Capitalism: The Transformation of the Former Soviet Bloc (in Russian and English)*

Anders Aslund

*Middle Classes in Russia: Economic and Social Strategies (in Russian)*

Tatyana Maleva, ed.

*Series of Lectures on Economics: Leading World Experts at the Carnegie Moscow Center (in Russian).*

Tatyana Maleva and Anders Aslund, eds.

*Working Papers: “Oil Production in Russia: State Policy and Prospects for Innovation”*

(in Russian), No 1, 2009

Anna Bessonova

*Working Papers: “Ups and Downs of the Russian Downstream” (in Russian and English), No 2, 2008*

Nina Poussenkova and Anna Bessonova

#### EXPERTS:

SERGEI  
ALEKSASHENKO

ANNA  
BESSONOVA

#### Key achievements

Analysis of the main problems of and prospects for the Russian economy, including proposing areas of cooperation on ensuring energy security, solutions to help Russia recover from the crisis, and directions for Russia's post-crisis integration.



## The Carnegie Moscow Center's programs

### East-East: Partnership Beyond Borders



The East-East: Partnership Beyond Borders program was established at the Carnegie Moscow Center in October 2005. Integrating the Center into an international network of foundations and think tanks, the program has helped strengthen the collaborative and comparative dimensions of the Center's research and outreach, involving the Center's scholars in significant debates ongoing in Central and Eastern Europe, post-Soviet countries, Turkey and Mongolia.

At the Carnegie Moscow Center, the East-East program focuses on three key areas:

- Understanding the development of democracy and civic initiative in Russia in a comparative context;

- Strengthening ties between Russian analysts and their colleagues throughout the region;
- Expanding the scope of the public policy debate in Russia by introducing the ideas and experiences of colleagues from around the broader region.

The Carnegie Moscow Center uses the East-East program's resources to mobilize its existing programs and draw up new projects in the relevant areas in cooperation with civil society organizations and the expert community in Russia and other post-Soviet countries.

“The program gives us the chance to talk with our neighbors as neighbors, compare, analyze and work together,” says the program's chairman Andrei Ryabov. Particular emphasis is given to current political developments in the CIS, particularly in Ukraine and Belarus, and interaction between the different regional and domestic political trends in Russia itself. A second important area of work is studying the situation in the North and South Caucasus. Here, the program offers a comprehensive and integrated approach to the various conflicts in the region, which otherwise tend to be studied in isolation from each other. Third, the Carnegie Moscow Center aims to use the East-East program as a means for developing mechanisms to help Russian non-governmental organizations, especially organizations involved in protecting human rights and issues of state accountability, to learn from the experience of other countries. The Carnegie Moscow Center takes a flexible approach to its implementation of the East-East program in order to be able to respond swiftly to problems and opportunities as they come up over the course of each year.

EXPERT:

ANDREI  
RYABOV

The program facilitated the first major conference on the situation in the CIS following the Georgian war, with independent experts from almost all countries in the region, including Russia and Georgia, taking part; established a multi-vector dialogue with Ukrainian partners on various aspects of bilateral relations; held a series of unique meetings in Central Asia on regional security problems, with China's and Afghanistan's participation; and conducted a review of regional research experience in socio-political and election monitoring, development of local media and some other fields.

### Key achievements

Over several years now the program has facilitated the development of productive analysis and collaborative research with partners in Central and Eastern Europe and the former Soviet Union, placing Russia within the context of the shared transition processes taking place in the region.

## New faces – new prospects



As part of the world's first global think tank, the Carnegie Moscow Center celebrated its 15<sup>th</sup> anniversary in Russia by launching its Global Agenda Initiative with a new discussion series and fellowship program.

Starting in 2009, the Carnegie Moscow Center began an ongoing series of regular Global Agenda discussions, leveraging the Endowment's international resources with centers in Washington, Brussels, Beirut and Beijing and working with partners around the world to bring policymakers and influential analysts to a Moscow audience. The goal is to reintegrate Russia's own analysts and policymakers into the global discussions that will help resolve key challenges facing the international community.

Simultaneously, the Center – with the support of the Carnegie Corporation of New York – launched the new Carnegie Moscow Global Policy Fellowships, designed to attract senior American experts from a wide range of fields important to the future of the U.S.-Russian policy agenda.

“Events in the last few years – the world economic crisis, the military conflict in Georgia, continuing struggles over various aspects of physical, economic, energy and human security and global warming – have highlighted the necessity of improved communication between Moscow, Washington and other key world capitals to ensure the implementation of policies that are in the interest of Russia and its international partners and to prove that Russia and its partners – not least the United States – are able to work effectively together on problems of global importance,” says deputy director Sam Greene, who oversees this program.

The Center also hosts interns from around the world. Undergraduate and post-graduate students from Russia and other countries come to the Center, where they gain experience at a leading think tank and benefit from a multicultural environment. Over the last five years, we have had interns from Russia, Ukraine, Armenia, Azerbaijan, Lithuania, Turkmenistan, Poland, Israel, Britain, the United States, Spain, the Czech Republic, Italy, Germany, Austria, Colombia and many other countries. They participate fully in the Center’s life, attend seminars and conferences taking place here and are in daily contact with the Center’s experts and other staff. Since 2009, we have also begun systematically involving the students in the Center’s research work, giving them the opportunity to carry out and present their own research projects. Successful papers are discussed by the young members of the Center’s Research Council, together with invited representatives of the young academic community.

Throughout its fifteen years, the Carnegie Moscow Center has always looked forward, developing and innovating as it grew. We are proud of what has been accomplished and are looking forward to the future. ■

Idea and text  
*Natalia Bubnova*

Editor  
*Alexander Ioffe*

Designer  
*Yakov Krasnovsky*

Photographs of Moscow  
*Alexander Starikov*

Photographic processing  
*Andrey Vradny*

Print run 1000 copies

Printed by  
*August Borg,*  
47 Verkhnyaya  
Pervomayskaya Str.,  
Bldg. 1, Moscow,  
105264, Russia

© *Carnegie Endowment*  
*for International Peace,*  
2009

